Shining a Light on Implicit Bias to Improve the Quality of Early Learning for All Children

Walter S. Gilliam, PhD
Edward Zigler Center in Child Development & Social Policy
Yale University Child Study Center

Maryland Ready At Five
Building Equity in Early Learning

Linthicum Heights, Maryland
April 25, 2017

An Image of Challenging Behavior

VIDEO
A Response to Challenging Behaviors

VIDEO

Federal Attention to Preschool Expulsion

White House Attention to Preschool Expulsion & ECMHC

DHHS & ED Joint Position Statement (12/10/2014)

ED’s OCR Data Collection; 2014 Reauthorization of CCDBG
CT Governor Malloy signs PA 15-96 (8/5/2015)

FLASHBACK
2002
• Preschool children referred for evaluations due to expulsion
  • What are the rates? Who is most vulnerable?
  • What is the relevance of ECMHC
  • Curiosity; Strategy

---

**Prekindergarteners Left Behind**  
(Gilliam, 2005)

- 3,898 randomly selected prekindergarten lead teachers
  - All 40 states with PreK
  - 81.0% response rate
- Wide variety of classroom settings
  - 58% public school preK
  - 29% Head Start (14% in PS, 15% not)
  - 13% Other (Profit & Nonprofit Child Care)
Prekindergarteners Left Behind (2005)

- The Expulsion Question
  - Over past 12 months
  - Required terminating participation in program
  - Behavioral problem
  - No transition to more appropriate setting

PreK Expulsion Results: Nation

- 10.4% of PreK teachers expelled at least 1 child in past year due to behavior problems
  - 1 child (78%); 2 children (15%); 3 children (6%); 4 children (1%)
  - PreK Expulsion Rate = 6.7 / 1,000
  - K-12 Expulsion Rate = 2.1 / 1,000
电视节目在全美主要电视台播放

**CHILD CARE EXPULSION RATES**

- **Child Rates**
  - Detroit, MI (Grannan et al., 1999; n=127; 28%)
    - Rate = 28/1,000
  - Massachusetts (Gilliam & Shahar, 2006; n=119; 64%)
    - Rate = 27/1,000 (39% Classes)
  - Massachusetts (MA DOE, 2003; n=764; ?%)
    - Rate = 2% expelled; 1% “suggested,” 1% transferred
  - Colorado (Hoover, 2006; n=1,075; 17%)
    - Rate = 10/1,000

- **Center/Classroom Rates**
  - Illinois (Cutler & Gilkerson, 2002; n=195 I/T; 38%)
    - Rate = 42% of Centers
  - Alaska (Alaska CCPO, 2005; n=493; 71%)
    - Rate = 35% Centers
Expulsion Rates (per 1,000)

- K-12: 2.1
- PreK: 6.7
- Child Care: 27.4

---

### Many Factors Predict Preschool Expulsion

**Child-Teacher Ratio**

- Under 8: 5.2%
- 8 to 9: 8.8%
- 10 to 11: 18.7%
- 12 and Up: 25.7%

**Program Length of Day**

- Half-Day: 7.4%
- School-Day: 9.8%
- Extended-Day: 16.0%

**Teacher Job Stress**

- Low Stress: 2.3%
- Average Stress: 6.4%
- High Stress: 14.7%

**Access to Behavioral Supports**

- No Access: 16.5%
- On-Call Access: 10.3%
- On-Site Access: 8.8%

---


Therefore,…

Preschool Expulsion
Is NOT a Child Behavior.

It is an Adult Decision.

Who Gets Expelled?

- 4-year-olds 50% more likely than 3’s
- Black preschoolers more than 2 times as likely as white preschoolers
- Boys more than 4 times as likely as girls
The CBC takes notice (2007)

Congressman Danny K Davis
- US Representative (D-IL7)
- Congressional Black Caucus
- Education Committee

Jill Hunter-Williams, PhD
- Dep Chief of Staff
- HS ECMHC

US Department of Education
Office of Civil Rights (2014, 2016)

http://ocrdata.ed.gov

- March 2014 (2011-2012 data)
  - “Black children make up 18% of preschool enrollment, but 48% of preschool children suspended more than once.”
  - “Boys receive more than three out of four out-of-school preschool suspensions.”

- June 2016 (2013-2014 data)
  - Black preschoolers 3.6 times as likely to be suspended as white preschoolers
  - Blacks represent 19% of preschoolers, but 47% of suspensions
  - Boys represent 54% of preschoolers, but 78% of suspensions
How can a federal issue be translated into a multi-state issue?

So, Why Are Our Boys and Our Black Children Most At Risk?

- Potential Reasons:
  - Boys are more susceptible to stressors (Autor et al, 2015).
  - Children of color often have more stressors.
  - Children of color often attend programs of poorer quality and fewer resources (Barnett et al, 2013).
- Yet, these alone don’t seem to account for all of the disparities in early suspensions and expulsions.
What Else May Account?

• Is it possible that implicit biases about our boys and especially our black boys may play a role?

  – Black boys more likely to be suspended/expelled for similar behaviors in elementary school (Skiba et al., 2011).
  – Biases about black boys
    • Older (Goff et al., 2014)
    • Culpable (Goff et al., 2014; Eberhardt et al, 2004; Todd et al., 2016)
    • Less likely to feel pain (Dore et al., 2014)
  – “Shifting Standards” (Harber et al., 2012)

Finally, A Study of Implicit Bias in ECE

• Jan 2015 – Funding (Thanks, W.K. Kellogg Foundation!)

• Nov 2015 – Collected Data

• Sep 2016 – Released Report of Findings
Participants (N = 132; 94% Female)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Classroom teacher</td>
<td>68.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Center director</td>
<td>9.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student teachers</td>
<td>9.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (e.g., combination of professional roles)</td>
<td>9.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No response</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Center type</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Faith-affiliated program</td>
<td>22.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School-based PreK</td>
<td>17.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not-for-profit</td>
<td>11.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Head Start</td>
<td>8.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For profit</td>
<td>7.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (e.g., independent school, special education)</td>
<td>31.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher Race</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>65.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>22.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teaching Experience</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Min</th>
<th>Max</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Years working at current location</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Years working in early education</td>
<td>11.0</td>
<td>9.10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Eye Tracking Procedures

- **Instructions:** “Now you are ready to view a series of video clips lasting 6 minutes. We are interested in learning about how teachers detect challenging behavior in the classroom. Sometimes this involves seeing behavior before it becomes problematic. The video segments you are about to view are of preschoolers engaging in various activities. Some clips may or may not contain challenging behaviors. Your job is to press the enter key on the external keypad every time you see a behavior that could become a potential challenge [experimenter demonstrates]. Please press the keypad as often as needed.”
Eye-Tracking Sample Clip

VIDEO

Eye Tracking Procedures

VIDEO
 Areas of Interest

Which child required the most of your attention?

A
B
Please remember the letter of the child who you believe required the most of your attention.
C
D
Eye-Tracking Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Eye-tracking: Dwell Time (N=116)</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Black boy</td>
<td>0.2823</td>
<td>0.0699</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black girl</td>
<td>0.2584</td>
<td>0.0481</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White boy</td>
<td>0.2258</td>
<td>0.0487</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White girl</td>
<td>0.2334</td>
<td>0.0475</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Main: Λ= .693, F=50.87, p<.001, d=1.33.
Interaction: Λ=.925, F=9.36, p<.01, d=.57.

Vignette Procedure

- Standardized vignette, manipulated child sex and race: DeShawn, Latoya, Jake, Emily
- “Act as if this child is in your classroom”
- Background or No Background
Vignette Results

- White teachers evidence lower behavioral standards for black children, but black teachers hold black children to relatively high standards.

- Teachers’ knowledge of family stressors tends to cause them to view behaviors as being less severe, but only if teacher and child race match. If racial mismatch, then opposite effect. (consistent with empathy research)

F=8.99, p=.004, η²=.10.

F=5.69, p=.019, η²=.06.
Reflections from Child Care Providers

VIDEO

Why Care about Disparities in Early Expulsion?
Social Justice and Civil Rights Are Often Matters of Access
Thank You! To Read More...

http://www.rwjf.org/content/dam/farm/reports/issue_briefs/2016/rwjf431300/subassets/rwjf431300_2

Random-Controlled Evaluation of ECMHC (Sep 2016)
http://www.jaacap.com/

Yale Preschool Implicit Bias Study (Sep 2016)
www.ziglercenter.yale.edu/publications/briefs.aspx

National Academy of Sciences (Oct 2016)

Preschool Suspension & Expulsion Timeline
www.ziglercenter.yale.edu/publications/expulsion.aspx

Follow me on Twitter: @WalterGilliam